Minutes Meeting 17 held 11th August 2020



Details

Meeting: Healthy Floodplains Review

Committee

Location: Teleconference

Date/time: Tuesday 11 August 2020

9.00am - 12.00 pm

Chairperson:

Attendees

Committee:

- 1. Independent Chair
- 2. Landholder from the Caroona area of the Liverpool Plains
- 3. Council and landholder Mudgee
- 4. Local Irrigator and landholder Moree

DPIE – Water Healthy Floodplains:

- 5. Healthy Floodplains Project, DPIE
- 6. Senior Project Officer, DPIE
- 7. Senior Project Officer, DPIE
- 8. (minutes), Project Officer, DPIE

Natural Resources Access Regulator:

- 9. Senior Water Regulatory
- 10. Senior Water Regulatory
 Officer, NRAR

Apologies

– Manager FloodplainHarvesting, NRAR

Minutes Meeting 17 held 11th August 2020



This meeting

No.	Issue	Action	Responsible
1	Welcome and confirmation of agenda	welcomed all and noted attendance / apologies.	
2	Confirmation of meeting 28 July 2020 minutes	Moved Seconded	Chair
3.	Confirmation of draft determination letters from 28 July meeting. proposed new procedure for committee confirmation of draft determination letters:	Moved Seconded Seconded	Chair
	The department will email the draft determination letters to the committee and the chairperson will allow 2 days for committee members to raise any issues. After 2 days the chairperson will provide confirmation to the department on behalf of the committee.	Endorsed by the committee.	All
4.	The committee raised concerns regarding the meetings required to process the determinations. The simpler methodology for the remaining valleys would reduce meeting times. October is harvest time and committee members will have limited availability.	Noted	
5	Declaring conflict of interests	None declared	Chair
6	Review of submissions		All
7	Submission # 25-G082		All
8	Submission # 45-G034		All



No.	Issue	Action	Responsible
9	Submission # 77-G045		All
10	Submission # G047		All
11	Submission # G100		All
12	Submission # 74-G079		All
13	Submission # 52-G090		All
14	Submission #40-G096		All
15	Submission #38-G058		All
16	Submission #48-G037		All
17	Submission #78-G123	Deferred for Department to provide advice on how these unregulated submissions should be dealt with by the committee.	All
18	Submission #41-G153	Deferred for Department to provide advice on how these unregulated submissions should be dealt with by the committee.	All
	Break	Meeting paused at 10.28 am, reconvened at 10.40 am.	
19	Submission #81-G024		All
	81-G025		
20	Submission #46-G040		All



No.	Issue	Action	Responsible
21	Submission #82- G023_G027_G028_G031		All
22	Submission #16- G052 G055 (returning)		All
23	Submission #47-G057 (returning)		All
24	Submission #32-BR014 (returning)		All
25	Submission #45-BR034 (returning)		All
26	Submission #12-G011 (returning)		All
27	Submission #46-G039 (returning)		All
28	Submission #31-G062 (returning)		All
29	Submission #35-BR031 (returning)		All
	Other Business		
30	requested information about the environmental assessment, when it was being done and when was the information released?	to enquire and report back to committee.	
31	raised concerns that other committee members were discussing her role on the committee with others outside of the committee and asked for it to stop.	Noted, including reminder of confidentiality agreements.	All



Minutes Meeting 17 held 11th August 2020

No	. Issue	Action	Responsible
	Meeting close	12.05 pm	Chair

Submission Outcomes

Submission number and property	Issue	Comment	Committee Determination	Actions
25-G082	Contesting storage volumes x 3.		Recommend: Based on anecdotal evidence rather than verified evidence as requested that: FPH1 – Remain at 1850ML FPH2 – Remain at 3740ML Based on evidence provided that: FPH3 - Increase of 570ML/day from 3780ML An increase for property of 570 ML from a total of 8530 ML to 9100ML.	Letter drafted and sent to committee 12 August 2020.
	2. Contesting pump rates FPH 19, 20 and 21.		Recommend: FPH 19 (3 pumps) – 2 x 153 ML/day, 1 x 160 ML/day for a total of 446 ML/day. FPH 20 (2 pumps) 1 x 140ML/day, 1 x 154ML/day for a total of 282ML/day FPH 21 (2 pumps) 2 x 164ML/day for a total of 328ML/day.	
45-G034	1. Requesting increase storage volume by 110 ML to 1100 ML.		Recommend: Storage volume of FPH3 remains as 990ML.	Letter drafted and sent to committee 12 August 2020.



	2. Requesting amendment of FPH14 from 900mm to 1200mm.		Recommend: Amending pipe size of FPH14 from 900mm to 1200mm.	
77-G045	1. Contesting storage volume FPH 4.		Recommend: FPH 4 to remain at from 600 ML based on SBM survey data for eligible works.	Letter drafted and sent to committee 12 August 2020.
	2. Requesting addition of a centrifugal 500mm pump.	Not supported as post 2008 however may be included in WSWA.	Recommend: That the 500mm centrifugal pump is not included in eligible works.	
	3. Requesting addition of channel.		Recommend: Inclusion of channel network as mapped in Appendix 1, page 7 in the G045 submission - highlighted blue as eligible works.	
	4. Inclusion of 1200mm pipe culvert at FPH 8 location that controls and delivers overland flows captured into OFS 4.		Recommend: Inclusion of 1200mm pipe site at FPH 8 location.	
G047	1. Contesting storage volume (FPH1, FPH2, FPH3).		Recommend: FPH1 – Increase of 179ML from 500ML to 679ML FPH2 – No increase remains at 90ML as no evidence supplied. FPH3 – Decrease of 30ML from 710ML to 680ML based on surveyors information.	Letter drafted and sent to committee 12 August 2020



			Total increase of 149ML from 1300ML to 1449ML.	
	2. Requesting amendment to FPH9 to a different location as they state our location is incorrect.	NRAR acknowledge that this was an error during mapping.	Recommend: Inclusion of pipe at FHP 9 at a different location not recommended as eligible works. Refer to NRAR for compliance.	
	3. Requesting amendment to 1 x electric axial flow and 1 x 660mm centrifugal pump.		Recommend: Pump configuration at 2008 remain as 1 x 660mm centrifugal and 1 x 500mm centrifugal for eligible works. Updated pumps (1 x electric axial flow & 1 x 660mm) to be included in WSWA.	
G100	1. Contesting storage volume FPH1.		Recommend: FPH1 – remain at 60 ML.	
74-G079	Requesting additional storage (surge area).		Recommend: Additional surge not supported. This request is out of scope for the committee and cannot be included in eligible FPH works.	Letter drafted and sent to committee 12 August 2020.
	2. Requesting 3 additional pump stations.	The pump site is only 'proposed' and exact location not supplied, no clear supporting evidence to justify inclusion of the works in either	Recommend: That the 3 pump stations are not supported.	



	3. Contesting pump capacity from 29 ML/day to 380 ML/day.	the eligible plan of works or WSWA. Such works would require an amended or new WSWA approval. Letter to applicant incorrectly stated a pumping rate rather than a pipe flow rate.	Recommend: That DPIE amend modelling data to reflect a 600mm pipe flow rate of 29ML/day at FPH 4. That the pumps are not supported for FPH eligible works.	
52-G090	1. Contesting storage volume (FPH1, FPH2, FPH3 & FPH4).		Recommend: FPH1 – Increase of 139ML from 440ML to 579ML FPH2 – Increase of 62ML from 720ML to 782ML FPH3 – Decrease of 115ML from 1060 to 945ML FPH4 - Increase of 388ML from 2770ML to 3158ML Total increase of 474ML from 4990ML to 5464ML.	Letter drafted and sent to committee 12 August 2020.
	2. Contesting pipe size FPH14 from 900mm to 1050mm.	It appears the dimensions where incorrect in department geodatabase as shown by evidence supplied.	Recommend: Amending FPH14 from 900mm to 1050mm pipe.	
	3. Contesting pipe size FPH15 from 900mm to 1050mm.	It appears the dimensions where incorrect in department geodatabase as	Recommend: Amending FPH15 from 900mm to 1050mm pipe.	



40-G096	1. Contesting storage volume of OFS1 and OFS2.	shown by evidence supplied.	Recommend: FPH1 - Increase of 369ML to 10799 FPH2 - Increase of 120ML to to 2089 ML Total increase of 489ML from	Letter drafted and sent to committee 12 August 2020.
	2.Contesting the pump sizes at FPH 7 and FPH 8.		Recommend: Revise pump size for eligible works. FPH 7- 1 by 700m axial (Diesel) FPH 8- 4 by 600mm axial (2 x diesel and 2 x electric).	
	3.Contesting pipe size for FPH activity numbers 3,4,5 and 6.		Recommend: FPH3 amend pipe size from 2 by 1000mm to 2 by1150mm FPH4 amend pipe size from 1 by 900mm to 1 by 1050mm FPH5 amend pipe size from 1 by 900mm pipe to 2 by 1200mm pipes FPH6 amend pipe size from 1 by 900mm to	



			1450mm.	
38-G058	1. Contesting storage volume x 2.		Recommend: FPH1 - Increase of 116ML from 980ML to 1096ML FPH2 - Increase of 175ML from 1240ML to 1415ML Increase for property of 291 ML from a total of 2220 ML to 2511 ML.	Letter drafted and sent to committee 12 August 2020.
	3. Requesting addition of sacrificial field.	Not supported by NRAR for eligible works. To be addressed under the modelling review.	Out of scope for the committee as it is not an eligible FPH.	
	4. Requesting amendment of pump sizes FPH 11.	FPH11 -2 x 660mm centrifugal pumps and 1 x 500mm centrifugal pump eligible works and work approval applicati on and assessment.	Recommend: FPH11 - 2 x 660mm centrifugal pumps and 1 x 500mm centrifugal pump eligible works and WSWA.	
	5. Contesting pump flow rate FPH 12.	Change FPH 12 to 1 x 500mm axial flow with pump capacity for both Eligible works and work approval applicati on and assessment.	Recommend: Change FPH 12 to 1 x 500mm axial flow with pump capacity 95 ML/day.	
	6. Requesting inclusion of channel	When combined with LiDAR there is strong evidence for inclusion as an intercepting	Recommend: Inclusion of channel.	



	7. Requesting addition of 1050mm pipe from Field 3.	channel for both an eligible work. Omitted from original application and field inspection mapping. A pipe primarily for take of TWR to external channel (not mapped). Pipe could be opened to allow water into field 3 and to be included as eligible works.	Recommend: The addition of 1050mm pipe from Field 3 as eligible works.	
	8. Requesting addition of 1050mm pipe from Field 4	Pipe 7 feeds water across floodway via channel 13 which also intercepts FPH and is deemed eligible NRAR error that should be fixed to deem this Pipe 4(1218) to be eligible and require a work approval. This pipe is the main return pipe for the water off the floodway and souther fields back to both storages.	Recommend: Point 7 and point 4 pipe 1200mm included as eligible works and WSWA.	
48-G037	1. A groundwater only property. NRAR has determined using FPH Policy.	A draft entitlement of 1116ML has been accepted by applicant.	This submission is out of scope for the committee. NRAR to provide WIP to applicant.	Letter drafted and sent to committee 12 August 2020.



78-G123	1. Claiming additional 536ha of irrigated area 1993-99 (from 434ha to 970ha)	Property has been divided into 2 (and and and sold. Assessed for FPH as one property as that is how they operated in 2008. Applicant is basing request on total area developed for irrigation, not the actual amount of crop grown /irrigated in the period 1993-99.	Defer until department advice on role of committee to determine.	
41-G153	1. Confirmation of eligible works on	Property has been divided into 2 and sold. Assessed for FPH as one property. Both owners have confirmed that the split for their properties will be 50:50 split resulting in an entitlement of 1180ML. The registrant has accepted this draft entitlement.	Defer until department provides advice to committee on their role.	Letter drafted and sent to committee 12 August 2020.
81-G024	1. Contesting storage volume FPH 2 and FPH 4.		Recommend: FPH 2 volume remain at 4860ML – no other evidence provided	Letter drafted and sent to committee 12 August 2020.



	2. Contesting pipe	FPH 4 volume remain at 233ML- no evidence provided. Recommend:	
	size FPH 7 (amend from 900mm to 1800mm).	FPH 7 pipe size remain as 900mm. Increase not supported.	
	3. Contesting pump size FPH 19 and subsequent flow rate (amend from 500mm to 660mm)	Recommend: FPH 19 pump size remains as 500mm axial at 65ML/day.	
	4. Requesting amendment of pump type from centrifugal to axial flow FPH 20, FPH 21 and FPH 23.	Recommend: Pump type at FPH 20, FPH 21 and FPH 23 be noted to 500mm axial flows.	Send photos to committee to confirm.
	5. Contesting pump size FPH 22 (from 600mm to 660mm).	Recommend: FPH 22 pump size of 660mm not supported as eligible works, refer to WSWA process.	
81-G025	1. Contesting storage volume FPH 2 and FPH 4.	Recommend: Due to lack of evidence that storage volumes remain as:	
		FPH 3 – 1020 ML	
		FPH 4 – 1500 ML	
		FPH 5 – 2450 ML.	
	6. Contesting storage volume FPH 3, FPH 4 & FPH 5.	Recommend: That storage volumes remain due to lack of evidence: FPH 3 – 1020 ML	



T	1		
		FPH 4 – 1500 ML	
		FPH 5 – 2450 ML.	
7. Requesting		Recommend:	
amendment of pipes FPH 11 and		That pipe sizes for FPH 11	
FPH 14 from		and FPH 14 remain at 1200mm due to lack of	
1200mm to 1500mm.		evidence.	
1000111111			
8. Requesting	Error in	Recommend:	
amendment of	department	Amending FPH 15 and FPH	
pipes FPH 15 and FPH 16 from	database, change not supported.	16 pipes from 600mm to	
600mm to	пос зарропса.	1200mm.	
1200mm.			
0 D	Evidence	Recommend:	
9. Requesting additional 660mm	requested 12	That the additional	
pump at site FPH	June 2020 – nil	centrifugal 660mm pump at	
21.	supplied.	site FPH 21 is not	
		supported.	
10. Requesting	Evidence	Recommend:	
amendment of	requested 12	Due to lack of evidence that	
FPH 24 from 500mm to 660mm	June 2020 – nil supplied.	pump FPH 23 is not	
and subsequent	заррпса.	amended to 660mm pump and that flow rate remains	
change in flow rate from 65ML to		unchanged.	
120ML/day.			
11. Requesting			
amendment of		Recommend:	
FPH 24 from 500mm to 660mm		That pump FPH 24 is not	
and subsequent		amended from 500mm to a	
change in flow rate from 65ML to		660mm pump is not supported due to a lack of	
120ML/day.		evidence and that flow rate	
_		remains unchanged.	



46-G040	1. Contesting storage volume x 2 (FPH7 & FPH8).		Recommend: Amending storage volumes FPH 7 – a decrease of 137ML from 1220ML to 1883ML. FPH 8 – an increase of 74ML from 2240ML to 2314 ML. Decrease for property of 63 ML from a total of 3460 ML to 3397 ML.	Letter drafted and sent to committee 12 August 2020.
	2. Requesting amendment to pump size FPH20 to 2 x 660mm at flow rate 240ML	Original field inspection noted pumps as 660mm pump.	Recommend: Amendment to pump size FPH 20 to 2 x centrifugal 660mm at combined flow rate 240 ML.	
	3.Request to add work added called a "cutting".		Recommend: Request for works called a 'cutting' is not supported for eligible FPH work.	
	4.Request additional1500m m pipe to be added. Functions to convey tailwater and rainfall runoff irrigation fields.		Out of scope for the committee as it is not an eligible FPH. Refer to NRAR for WSWA.	
	5. Lengthen and connect channel 26 to the NE corner of cell 7.		Out of scope for the committee as it is not an eligible FPH work. Refer to NRAR for WSWA.	
	6. Lengthen channel 29		Recommend:	



	through SE corner of development.		Channel not supported as no evidence at 2008.	
82- G023_G027_G0 28_G031	1. Requesting additional 1500mm pipe.	Evidence request 12/6/20, nil received.	Recommend: The additional 1500mm pipe for FPH is not supported. Maintain NRAR volume 2100ML.	Letter drafted and sent to committee 12 August 2020.
	2. Request increase to OFS1.	Evidence requested 12/6/20, nil received.	Recommend: That storage volume for FPH 1 remains as 2400ML.	
	3. Requesting additional 1200mm pipe.	Evidence requested 12/6/20, nil received.	Recommend: That the 1200mm pipe not supported as installed post 2008.	
	4. Contesting storage volume FPH 2 & FPH 3	Evidence requested 12/6/20, nil received.	Recommend: FPH 2 - an increase of 220ML is not supported. Volume to remain at 680ML. FPH 3 - an increase of 1170 ML not supported. Volume to remain at 630ML.	
	5. Requesting additional storage surge cell - 6500ML.	Evidence requested 12/6/20, nil received.	Out of scope for the committee as it is not an eligible FPH work. Refer to modellers.	



		As OFS has been noted as a surge it has been noted as "Temp only' for 2008 and for modelling only.		
	6. Requesting additional pipes/gates x 3 (1200mm).	Evidence requested 12/6/20, nil received.	Recommend: Pipes not included as eligible works due to connectivity to	
	7. Contesting storage volume FPH1. Increase for property of 1170 ML from a total of 5910 ML to 7000 ML.	Evidence requested 12/6/20, nil received.	Recommend: Increase to FPH1 not supported. Maintain volume 5910 ML.	
Returning				
G055				
	2. Contesting OFS capacity x 3.	Issue 2 tabled 17th June 2020. Committee request for further information. Additional storage curve evidence provided.	Recommend: FPH1 - increase of 65ML from 860ML to 925ML FPH2 - increase of 33ML from 1490ML to 1523ML FPH3 - increase of 184ML from 1830ML to 2014ML Increase for property of 282ML from a total of 4180 ML to 4462ML.	Letter drafted and sent to committee 12 August 2020.
Returning				
47-G057	1. Contesting storage volume x 2 (FPH1 and FPH3).		Recommends amending storage volumes as follows: FPH1 - increase of 200ML from 840ML to 1040ML FPH3 - increase of 224ML from 3380ML to 3604ML.	Letter drafted and sent to committee 12 August 2020.



	2. Contesting pump capacities. 3. Gravity take into OFS (3 pipes) and gravity take capacity (1280 ML/day) over and above the pump capacity for the property.	This submission was reviewed by the committee on 28th July 2020. Deferred for NRAR to provide a plan of works that the requests relate to (Issue 3). NRAR support the addition of: OFS 3: 2 x 1200mm pipes and 1 x 1500mm pipe.	Recommend: Amending combined pump capacities for FPH17, FPH18, FPH19 to 660ML/day. Recommend: FPH 3 be amended to include 2 x 1200mm pipes and 1 x 1500mm pipes.	Letter drafted and sent to committee 12 August 2020.
Returning				
32-BR014	1. Contesting storage capacity x 3 (FPH1, FPH2 & FPH3) FPH 1 (determined).	Updated storage curve details provided for FPH 2 and FPH 3.	Recommend: FPH 2 support capacity increase of 227ML to 1452ML. FPH3 support capacity increase of 165 to 895 ML.	Letter drafted and sent to committee 12 August 2020.
	5. Contesting pump capacity FPH 23		Recommend: Amending FPH 23 to 2 x 550 Batescrew pumps with a capacity of 350ML /day.	
	7. Contesting pump size and capacity FPH 25 from 70		Recommend: Capacity at FPH 25 be amended to 80 ML/day	



	ML/day to 80 ML/day.		based on Batescrew 2021 533 column pump.	
Returning				
45-BR034	1. Amend pipe size FPH 12 from 1200mm to 1500mm.		Recommend: Amending FPH 12 pipe from 1200mm to 1500mm as eligible works.	Letter drafted and sent to committee 12 August 2020.
	2. Amend pipe size FPH 20 from 900mm to 1050mm.		Recommend: Amending FPH 20 pipe from 900mm to 1050mm as eligible works.	
	3. Amend pipe size FPH26 from 1200mm to 1500mm.		Recommend: Amending FPH 26 pipe from 1200mm to 1500mm as eligible works.	
	4. Contesting pump flow rate at FPH27 - currently at 600 ML/day for all pumps - requesting 750ML/day.		Recommend: Amend pump flow capacity for FPH 27 - 5 x 660 mm centrifugal pumps from 600 ML/day to 750ML/day.	
Returning				
12-G011	1. Additional storage request to account for storage capacity for OFS3 prior to July 2008.	Reviewed by the committee on 21 May 2020. Reviewed by the committee on 14 July 2020.	Recommend: OFS3 storage volume be set at 259ML based on strong supporting evidence.	Letter drafted and sent to committee 12 August 2020.
Returning				



46-G039	1. Contesting storage volume x 4 (FPH1, FPH2, FPH3 & FPH5).	Reviewed by the committee 28 July 2020. Evidence required for volume at 2008 for Issue 1. Statutory declaration received 29 July 2020 regarding volume in 2008.	Recommend: FPH1 - Decrease of 92ML from 850ML to 758ML based on statutory declaration provided FPH2 - Increase of 64ML from 1590ML to 1654ML (1.2m freeboard) FPH3 - Increase of 914ML from 3820ML to 4734ML (1.2m freeboard) FPH5 - Increase of 14ML from 1320ML to 1334ML Increase for property of 992 ML from 7580 ML to 8572 ML.	Letter drafted and sent to committee 12 August 2020.
Returning	Issues 1 and 3 determined 12 June 2020.			
31-G062	2. Contesting volume of FPH 2 Cell 1 (Eastern).	Evidence from a qualified person or a Statutory declaration, that the volumes are as they were in 2008 (Issue 2). Received 29 July 2020.	Recommend: FPH 2 Cell 1 (Eastern) capacity be increased by 171 ML from a total of 1500 ML to 1671ML.	Letter drafted and sent to committee 12 August 2020.
Returning				
35-BR031	1. Contesting determination on 14 July 2020 for storages FPH 1 and FPH 3.		Recommend: Amending storage volumes: FPH1 - increase of 46 ML from 1600 ML to 1646 ML FPH3 - increase of 682 ML from 2360 ML to 3042 ML.	Letter drafted and sent to committee 12 August 2020



Minutes Meeting 17 held 11th August 2020

Meeting closed

12.05 pm

Next meeting

18 August 2020 (teleconference) 9.00 – 3.00 pm